

## Role of Kalla Group in Collaborative Governance Implementation of Covid-19 Management in Makassar City

Muhammad Yusran Amir<sup>1\*</sup>, Moh Thahir Haning<sup>2</sup>, Nurdin Nara<sup>2</sup>, Muhammad Yunus<sup>2</sup>, Gita Susanti<sup>2</sup>,  
Badu Achmadi<sup>2</sup>, Muh. Akmal Ibrahim<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Doctor of Public Administration, Department of Public Administration, Hasanuddin University, Indonesia

<sup>2</sup> Department of Public Administration, Hasanuddin University, Indonesia

\*Corresponding author, contact: [yusranfkmunhas@gmail.com](mailto:yusranfkmunhas@gmail.com)

### Abstract

This research is to analyze the dynamics of collaboration, and collaborative actions of the Kalla Group with the Makassar city government in tackling COVID-19. This research method is qualitative research that focuses on examining the phenomena that occur in the dynamics of collaboration, and collaborative actions between the government and the private sector in the implementation of the COVID-19 response in Makassar City. Data collection techniques were carried out through in-depth interviews, observation and document review, namely collecting and studying relevant data and supporting research, literature, lecture materials, expert theories, and documents or archives that support this research. The informants from this study were 6 key informants selected purposively. The results of the study show that the Kalla Group has very good collaboration with the Makassar City Government in tackling COVID-19 in Makassar city. The role of the Kalla Group is in 2 stages, namely 1) Collaborative Dynamics, and 2) Collaborative Actions. There are 3 aspects in the dynamics of collaboration, namely the mobilization of shared principles, building shared motivation, and the capacity to take joint action. The Kalla Group carries out various collaborative actions so as to have an impact on the health, economy, and education sectors. The conclusion is that the Kalla Group Company has very good collaboration in Collaborative Governance for handling COVID-19 with the City Government of Makassar.

**Keywords:** Covid-19, Kalla Group Company, Collaboration, Management

### Key Messages:

- The Kalla Group Company has very good collaboration in Collaborative Governance for handling COVID-19 with the Makassar City Government

Access this article online



Quick Response Code

Copyright (c) 2022 Authors.

Received: 10 November 2022

Accepted: 29 November 2022

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.56303/jhnresearch.v1i3.92>



This work is licensed under  
a Creative Commons Attribution-  
NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0  
International License

### 1. Introduction

COVID-19 is a pandemic outbreak that is sweeping the whole world right now. Secretary General of the World Health Organization (WHO), Dr. Tedros Adhanom Ghebreyesus, officially announced that COVID-19-19 was a Global Pandemic on 11 March 2020 (1). Globally, on 25 February 2022, data from WHO stated that there were 430,257,564 positive confirmed cases. Indonesia is one of the countries with the most significant number of COVID-19 sufferers in Southeast Asia; data from the official website on 27 February 2022 stated the number of sufferers was 5,539 394 positive people, 4,817 423 people recovered and 148,073 people died (2). While data on

21 February, the number of COVID-19 sufferers in South Sulawesi reached 11,627 active confirmations where there were 9,517 asymptomatic and 2,110 symptomatic; there were 10,8645 people (88.7%) recovered and 2257 people (1.8%) died. So the total confirmation is 122529 (3). Makassar is still the city with the highest number of COVID-19 in South Sulawesi. Data for 26 February 2022 shows that there are 7,358 positive confirmations. About 52957 people recovered, and 1040 died (4).

The main problem is the need for collaboration between actors in overcoming the transmission of COVID-19 in Indonesia. An article from Suhudiyah explains the government's role in reducing morbidity due to COVID-19 in Indonesia. The government needs to collaborate with several actors known as "Penta Helix Actors," namely five important actors who play an active role in preventing COVID-19: Government, Academics, Business or Private Institutions, Media and Society or Civil Society (5).Megawati et al. (2020) regarding Collaborative Governance in the City of Surabaya shows the importance of coordination between the central government and local governments so that Collaborative Governance can be successful (6). Other research from Andiraharja DG (2020) shows that local governments have an important role in reducing COVID-19, especially with the implementation of Law No. 32/2004, Article 22, related to regional autonomy in Indonesia (7).

This research is to find out and analyze the dynamics of collaboration and collaborative actions of the Kalla Group with the Makassar city government in tackling COVID-19.

## 2. Methods

This research method was qualitative research that focuses on examining the phenomena that occur in the dynamics of collaboration and collaborative actions between the government and the private sector in implementing the COVID-19 response in Makassar City. Data collection techniques were carried out through in-depth interviews, observation, and document review, including collecting and studying relevant data and supporting research, literature, lecture materials, expert theories, and documents or archives that support this research. The informants from this study were six key informants selected purposively. Interviews using interview guidelines were conducted face to face or offline, considering the number of corona cases from December 2021 to February 2022 has decreased.

## 3. Results

This research was conducted at the Kalla Group from 10 December 2021 to 17 February 2022. The type of research was qualitative research using an explanative study approach. Information was obtained through in-depth interviews, observation, and document review. Data sources were people who were asked to provide information and were willing to provide the information, called informants. The number of key informants was six people.

Table 1. Characteristics of Informants

| Informants           | Gender | Age (y.o) | Occupation              | Work Position                                 | Last Education  |
|----------------------|--------|-----------|-------------------------|---|-----------------|
| Ivan                 | Male   | 37        | NV Kalla Group employee | COVID-19 Task Force NV Kalla Group            | Bachelor Degree |
| Khaerul              | Male   | 42        | NV Kalla Group employee | COVID-19 Task Force NV Kalla Group            | Master Degree   |
| Nursaidah Sirajuddin | Female | 48        | Government employees    | Head of Makassar City Health Office           | Master Degree   |
| Zakiah               | Female | 49        | Government employees    | Head Of Disease Prevention Section            | Master Degree   |
| Ansariadi            | Male   | 50        | Lecturer at Unhas       | Makassar City Task-Force Expert Team          | Doctoral Degree |
| Hidayat              | Male   | 52        | Government employees    | Head of the Makassar City Covid-19 Task Force | Master Degree   |

Table 1 shows that the total number of key informants was six people, of which one had a Bachelor's Degree education level, 4 had a Master's Degree level, and one had Doctoral Degree. The study results show that the Kalla Group collaborated well with the Makassar City Government in tackling COVID-19 in Makassar city. The role of the Kalla Group was in 2 stages: 1) Collaborative Dynamics and 2) Collaborative Actions. There were three aspects in

the dynamics of collaboration: the mobilization of shared principles, building shared Motivation, and the capacity to take joint action. The Kalla Group conducted various collaborative actions to impact the health, economy, and education sectors.

The implementation of Collaborative Governance for handling COVID-19 between the Kalla Group companies and the City Government of Makassar focused on Prof. Kirk Emerson's theory 9. Collaboration between the Kalla Group companies and the Makassar City Government was well established and strong in two CGR variables: the dynamics of collaboration and action collaboration.

### **Collaborative Dynamics**

The collaboration dynamics are very well established between the Kalla Group companies and the City Government of Makassar. There are three variables in the dynamics of CGR collaboration, namely:

#### **1) Mobilization of the Shared Principles (Principle Engagement)**

The process of mobilizing the Joint Principles (Principle Engagement) began with the Decree of the Mayor of Makassar, Number 1073/443.2.05/Year 2020, regarding the COVID-19 Task Force in March 2020 when the first case of COVID-19 appeared in Makassar. Over time, the new Mayor, Ir Ramadhan Pomanto, created the Makassar Recover program based on Makassar Mayor Regulation NO. 5 of 2021, concerning Makassar Recover. The mayor included the private sector through the CSR forum and Kalla Groups in the COVID-19 Task Force in Makassar City. The Kalla Group company created a COVID-19 Task Force internally, and then the Task Force collaborated with the Makassar City Government and the Pentahelix Actor to collaborate in handling COVID-19 in Makassar City. Pentahelix actors who cooperate are 1) the Government; 2) Private Sector or private companies, including the Kalla Group; 3) Academics or intellectuals who are experts in the field of health in dealing with outbreaks; 4) Media, such as newspapers of Harian Fajar and other electronic media; 5) Civil Society such as the Indonesian Ulama Council (MUI) and other Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs).

The principled engagement has four stages: 1) discovery, definition, deliberation and determination. The discovery and definition process is carried out through a deliberation forum which is carried out through regular meetings which are held every Monday at the COVID-19 Task Force office in Makassar City.

#### **Discovery process**

The following are excerpts from interviews with informants: In the interview, an informant stated the basis for why they needed to collaborate:

*"We collaborate in the name of humanity and social life." (Head of Public Relations of the Indonesian Ulama Council, Civil Society, 2022)*

*"We need to collaborate to control the COVID-19 pandemic based on the Guidelines for Prevention and Control of COVID-19" (Academician, Epidemiology Consultant, Hasanuddin University, 2021)*

*"Kalla group, since the beginning of the pandemic, we are one of the companies in the city of Makassar which is at the forefront because management understands because Covid has had a major impact on the economy" (Kalla Group CSR Head, Private Sector, 2021)*

Based on this information, it can be concluded that the participants wanted to collaborate to reduce the spread of COVID-19 in Makassar. Meanwhile, the private sector focused on the economic impact on the community due to COVID-19 in this city.

#### **The main problem definition process of COVID-19 (Definition process)**

The informant stated:

*"The level of public awareness of COVID-19 is the main problem in preventing COVID-19 in Makassar City" (Head of CSR Kalla Group, Private Sector, 2021)*

*"The main problem with COVID-19 is hoaxes on social media in society" (Head of Public Relations of the Indonesian Ulama Council, Civil Society, 2022)*

Based on this information, the main problems of COVID-19 in Makassar were: the COVID-19 pandemic, Low public awareness, and misinformation and hoaxes related to COVID-19.

#### **Deliberation Process**

The deliberation process is carried out when Pentahelix actors work together in the discovery process, and further definitions of the deliberation process, where they are involved in communication and exchanging information oriented towards problem-solving. The following are excerpts of interviews with informants:

*"Kalla Group held a coordination meeting with the Makassar District Health Office before carrying out the*

*COVID-19 program" (Kalla Group CSR Head, Private Sector, 2021)*

### **Time-table determination process, agenda setting (Determination process)**

The following are excerpts of interviews with informants:

*"The agenda is that the Newspaper of Harian Fajar tries to publish one page of news related to COVID-19 every day" (Newspaper Editor, the Newspaper of Harian Fajar, 2021)*

*"Our schedule follows the schedule from the District Health Office" (Kalla Group CSR Head, Private Sector, 2021)*

Based on this information, it can be concluded that there was a timetable and agenda for preventing COVID-19 in the city of Makassar.

### **2) Shared Motivation**

The Kalla Group COVID-19 Task Force builds mutual trust in collaboration with the Makassar City Government. There is a personal commitment and commitment from the Kalla Group company in collaborating to tackle COVID-19 in Makassar City. Elements of shared motivation such as trust, mutual understanding, internal recognition, and commitment can be well developed between all stakeholders to create shared motivation. There are four components of shared motivation: trust, mutual understanding, internal legitimacy, and commitment.

#### **Trust**

The first element in shared motivation is the development of trust by all participants involved in the collaboration. They know each other and prove to each other that they are capable.

The following are excerpts of interviews with informants:

*"We know each other because there is an MoU (memorandum of understanding) with the government" (Newspaper Editor, the Newspaper of Harian Fajar, 2021)*

Based on this information, it can be concluded that there was trust from all pentahelix actors in the city of Makassar.

#### **Mutual Understanding**

Mutual understanding grows out of respecting the differences in others - whether differences in personality, position, interests, values or some other factor matter. The following are excerpts of interviews with informants:

*"All actors are involved in controlling COVID-19 in the city of Makassar" (Academician, Epidemiology Consultant, Hasanuddin University, 2021)*

Based on this information, it can be concluded that there was a mutual understanding of all pentahelix actors in the city of Makassar

#### **Internal Legitimacy**

Internal legitimacy is recognition that comes from internal collaborative actors or recognition from internal pentahelix actors. In this case, the actors involved in cooperation are required to be trusted and credible towards the common interest. The following are excerpts of interviews with informants:

*"There is very strong support from all actors and the local government" (Head of Makassar District Health Office, 2022)*

Based on this information, it can be concluded that there was internal legitimacy from all pentahelix actors in the city of Makassar.

#### **Commitment**

This commitment is the fourth element of shared motivation, in which pentahelix actors collaborate and enables collaboration across agency boundaries; collaborate across organizational boundaries; collaborate across sectoral boundaries, collaborate across regulatory boundaries, and previously separated their relationships and interactions and have now made a commitment to tackling COVID-19 in Makassar City. The following are excerpts of interviews with informants:

*"There is a commitment to cooperation because of the MoU (Memorandum of Understanding) with the government" (Newspaper Editor, the Newspaper of Harian Fajar, 2021)*

Based on this information, it can be concluded that there was a commitment from all pentahelix actors in the city of Makassar.

### **3) Capacity for Joint Action**

The Kalla Group COVID-19 Task Force makes institutional procedures and agreements that are carried out formally and informally in collaboration with Pentahelix Actors. Regarding leadership, Kalla Group leaders

strengthen and broaden their understanding regarding collaboration. The Kalla Group company had allocated nearly 2 billion Rupiah funds from March to December 2021 needed for collaborative activities.

#### **Procedures for institutional arrangements**

Procedures for institutional arrangements include guidance on the processes and organizational structures needed to govern relationships within the system. Collective agreements can be in the form of general rules, activity protocols, decision-making procedures and others. Cooperation agreements are often informal, but in the long term, and if the forum becomes large, formalization of the agreement is needed, namely the existence of a legal umbrella for cooperation, organizational structure, and administrative protocols. The following are excerpts of interviews with informants:

*"All elements involved in controlling COVID-19 in Makassar City, namely Forkopimda (Regional Leadership Communication Forum) and other stakeholders" (Academician, Epidemiology Consultant, Hasanuddin University, 2021)*

Based on this information, it can be concluded that there was already a Procedure for the institutional arrangement of COVID-19 prevention in Makassar City.

#### **Leadership**

Collaborative governance requires a leadership role so that systems and processes work within the policy framework. Collaborative leadership is different from everyday leadership. The main requirement for collaborative governance is the existence of a leader whom all stakeholders accept. The following are excerpts of interviews with informants:

*"The leadership role lies with the local government (Mayors of Makassar)" (Academician, Epidemiology Consultant, Hasanuddin University, 2021)*

Based on this information, it can be concluded that the collaborative leader was the Mayor of Makassar.

#### **Knowledge**

Knowledge is a central element of collaboration. Knowledge is all the information needed by actors to participate in collaborative processes. Knowledge, defined as information combined with understanding and ability, will become the capital of the participants. Furthermore, knowledge, social capital, and work ethic will become an action guide. The following are excerpts of interviews with informants:

*"Knowledge sharing is carried out by journalists gathering opinions from experts and the health service, as well as writing and publishing, in the form of news in a special column "new habits" (Newspaper Editor, the Newspaper of Harian Fajar, 2021)*

Based on this information, it can be concluded that knowledge sharing had occurred with all pentahelix actors in the city of Makassar.

#### **Resources**

One of the greatest benefits of collaboration is the potential to share and leverage each other's resources. Resources are potential values possessed by certain materials or elements in life. Resources are not always physical but also non-physical (intangible).

The following are excerpts of interviews with informants:

*"The HR is from Fajar daily, but the funding is from the government" (Newspaper Editor, the Newspaper of Harian Fajar, 2021)*

*"Kalla group provides facilities to the District Health Office, places and facilities, free consumption and around 2 billion rupiahs in funds" (Kalla Group CSR Head, Private Sector, 2021)*

Based on this information, it can be concluded that there had been resource sharing by pentahelix actors in the city of Makassar

#### **Collaborative Action between the Kalla Group and the City Government of Makassar**

The Kalla Group COVID-19 Task Force carried out promotive and preventive actions with the Makassar city government, namely (8):

1. Carry out 115 thousand doses of COVID-19 vaccination. Vaccinations were carried out 97 times in several public places such as a) Mall Nipah Makassar; b) Ratu Indah Mall (MARI); c) Bugis Water Park; d) Makassar Islamic University (UIM); e) Babussalam Borong Raya Mosque; f) Athirah Islamic School and other public places.

2. Provided assistance with Personal Protective Equipment (PPE) to 4064 medical personnel in 4 provinces of South Sulawesi, West Sulawesi, Southeast Sulawesi and Central Sulawesi.
3. Providing Personal Protective Equipment (PPE) assistance to 9 hospitals in Makassar City
4. Carry out disinfection activities in five sub-districts in Makassar City.
5. Providing assistance with 10,063 basic food packages for the poor.
6. Provided assistance in installing liquid hand-washing soap dispensers in mosques in Makassar City.

#### 4. Discussion

Emerson and Nabatchi (2012) define principled engagement as open and inclusive communication that occurs regularly through four fundamental processes, namely 1) discovery, 2) definition, 3) deliberation and 4) determination (9). The results of the study show that in March 2020, the City of Makassar implemented the formation of the COVID-19 Task Force based on the Mayor's Decree Number 1073/443.2.05/2020. Pervali (2020). A year later, after the election of the new mayor of Makassar. The newly elected mayor launched the Makassar Recovery Program to prevent COVID-19 in Makassar based on Mayor Decree No. 5 Year 2021. The first meeting took place on 5 March 2021, discussing coordination and cooperation with all stakeholders. Information obtained from informants indicates that the principles have been outlined in routine meetings and occasional forums organized by the Makassar Recovery Program COVID-19 Task Force. The principle engagement results are consistent with Hung YW et al. (2020), with research showing that Taiwan is successfully fighting COVID-19 through government initiatives and collaborative governance (10). Research findings by Manggalou S (2022) show that collaborative governance requires vertical and horizontal communication (consultation) to be successful in Surabaya (11). The results of strengthening the principle of commitment are also in line with Choi's research (2020) in South Korea, that the effectiveness of collaborative governance is highly dependent on public participation (12). The findings of these considerations became material for a research study by Nuryanti Mustar (2021), which stated that the Mayor of Makassar also carried out a negotiation process with the provincial government and local government to deal with the COVID-19 crisis (13).

There are four components of shared motivation: trust, mutual understanding, internal legitimacy, and commitment. Information from informants stated that there had been a process of mutual motivation by pentahelix actors in Makassar. The existence of trust between actors in collaborative activities is a strength to achieve common goals. This study's results align with Muta'al R M et al. (2022), showing that trust and commitment between participants play an important role in tackling COVID-19 in the City of Surakarta (14). Collaborative governance requires internal coordination and legitimacy of pentahelix actors to succeed (15). Orth, Patricia B., and Antony S. Cheng (2018) stated that mutual understanding greatly influences adaptation and implementation in collaborative governance (16). The research results of Saputra Aditya and Sri Juni Woro Astuti (2021) show that collaborative governance requires a mutual understanding between the government and civil society to succeed in Surabaya (17).

There are four components of capacity for collective action: institutional arrangements procedures, leadership, knowledge and resources. Information from informants stated that there had been a process of mutual motivation by pentahelix actors in Makassar. The results of the research are in line with Amin R et al (2021), which shows that collaborative governance requires institutional regulatory procedures, namely joint decision-making and formal organization, to be successful in Pekanbaru (18). Arinanda Arianda et al. (2022) research results show that a lack of knowledge causes people to not comply with the health protocol for preventing Covid-19 in Aceh (19). Belhadjali and Abbasi (2022) state leadership's importance in turning the COVID-19 disaster into an efficient response (20). The results of research by Alfitra Perdana et al. (2021) show that collaborative governance requires adequate resources to be successful (21). The results of Bonso H and Irwan's research (2021) show that collaborative governance requires quality human resources, infrastructure, and adequate resources to be successful (22).

#### 5. Conclusion

Based on research carried out at the Makassar City Kalla Group Company in 2021, it can be concluded that the Kalla Group Company has very good collaboration in Collaborative Governance for handling COVID-19 with the Makassar City Government. The suggestion is that the Kalla Group Company should collaborate with all pentahelix actors from the government, private companies, newspaper and electronic media, academics and the community

(civil society).

**Funding:** none

**Acknowledgments:** We would like to thank the Kalla Group Company and the Makassar City Government for their assistance and good cooperation so that this research can be carried out well.

**Conflicts of Interest:** The authors declare no conflict of interest

## References

1. WHO. WHO Director-General's opening remarks at the media briefing on COVID-19 - 11 March 2020. World Health Organization. 2020.
2. Satgas COVID-19. Informasi terbaru seputar penanganan COVID-19 di Indonesia oleh Pemerintah [Internet]. 2022 [cited 2023 Jan 2]. Available from: <https://covid19.go.id/#>
3. Dinkes Provinsi Sulsel. Sulsel Tanggap COVID-19 [Internet]. 2022 [cited 2023 Jan 2]. Available from: <https://covid19.sulselprov.go.id/info>
4. Dinas Kesehatan Kota Makassar. Info Penanggulangan COVID-19 Kota Makassar [Internet]. 2022 [cited 2023 Jan 2]. Available from: <https://covid19.makassarkota.go.id/>
5. Sailatur Rizqi As Suhudiyah. Peran Parlemen dalam Menciptakan Collaborative Governance Berbasis Pendekatan Penta Helix Stakeholder untuk Mengatasi Pandemi Covid-19. Pusat Penelitian Politik. 2021.
6. Megawati S, Niswah F, Oktariyanda TA. Collaborative Governance as Handling Efforts of Pandemic Covid-19 in Surabaya City. 2020;473(April):312-6.
7. Andiraharja DG. Peran Pemerintah Daerah Pada Penanganan Covid-19. Jurnal Politik Pemerintahan Dharma Praja. 2020;13(1):52-68.
8. Yayasan Kalla. CSR Kalla Group [Internet]. Yayasan Hadji Kalla. 2022 [cited 2023 Jan 2]. Available from: <https://www.yayasanhadjikalla.co.id/>
9. Emerson K, Nabatchi T, Balogh S. An Integrative Framework for Collaborative Governance. Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory. 2012 Jan 1;22(1):1-29.
10. Hung, Yuen Wai, Cortes, Marina, Staples, Mara Hansen. Creative Public-Private Collaborations in Taiwan and South Korea Bolster the Fight Against Coronavirus. Stanford Social Innovation Review [Internet]. 2020 [cited 2023 Jan 2]; Available from: [https://ssir.org/articles/entry/creative\\_public\\_private\\_collaborations\\_in\\_taiwan\\_and\\_south\\_korea\\_bolster\\_the\\_fight\\_against\\_coronavirus](https://ssir.org/articles/entry/creative_public_private_collaborations_in_taiwan_and_south_korea_bolster_the_fight_against_coronavirus)
11. Manggalou S. Sinergitas Collaborative Governance Dalam Pencegahan Dan Penanganan Pandemi Covid-19 Kota Surabaya. publicuho. 2022 Aug 3;5(3):575-90.
12. Choi YJ. The Power of Collaborative Governance: The Case of South Korea Responding to COVID-19 Pandemic. World Medical & Health Policy. 2020;12(4):430-42.
13. Mustari N, Junaedi J, Hardi R, Nurmandi A, Hamrun H, Hartaman N. Local Government Crisis Management in Response to Covid-19: Case Study of South Sulawesi, Indonesia. Public Policy and Administration. 2021 Dec 17;20(4):480-500.
14. Muta'al MR. Collaborative Governance dalam Penanganan Pandemi Covid-19 (Coronavirus Disease 2019) Di Kelurahan Mangkubumen, Kecamatan Banjarsari, Kota Surakarta. Solidaritas [Internet]. 2022 May 20 [cited 2023 Jan 2];6(1). Available from: <https://ejurnal.unisri.ac.id/index.php/sldrts/article/view/7227>
15. Putera RE, Tengku Rika, Putri Febri, Nia Audina. Collaborative Governance dalam Penanganan Penyebaran Kasus Corona Virus Disease-19 Di Kota Padang. In: Konferensi Nasional Ilmu Administrasi [Internet]. Bandung: Politeknik STIA LAN Bandung; 2020. p. 133-7. Available from: <http://repo.unand.ac.id/37827/1/Prosiding%20KNIA%204.0%202020-1.pdf>
16. Orth PB, Cheng AS. Who's in Charge? The Role of Power in Collaborative Governance and Forest Management. Humboldt Journal of Social Relations. 2018;40:191-210.
17. Saputra A, Astuti SJW. Collaborative Governance Dalam Penanganan Pandemi Covid 19 Di Kota Surabaya (Study Kasus Di Kelurahan Kandangan). Jurnal Inovasi Sektor Publik. 2022;2(1):7-15.

18. Amin RM, Febrina R, Wicaksono B. Tata Kelola Kolaboratif dalam Penanganan COVID 19 di Kota Pekanbaru. *Jurnal Bina Praja: Journal of Home Affairs Governance*. 2021 Apr 30;13(1):1-13.
19. Arinanda A, Yani A, Aiyub A, Nazaruddin N, Aisyah T. Collaborative Governance in Minimizing the Covid-19 Pandemic in North Aceh Regency. *International j of Public Administration stud*. 2022 Sep 16;2(1):14.
20. Belhadjali M, Abbasi S. COVID-19: The Role of Leadership in Response to Disruption. *International Journal for Innovation Education and Research*. 2020 Aug 1;8(8):362-5.
21. Alfitra Perdana V, Syafiqurrohman A, Noor Cahyadi Eko Saputro M, Aribah Hanif N, Miftahul Ahsan M, Husein R. Collaborative Governance Dalam Penanggulangan Covid-19 Studi Kasus : Pemerintah Daerah Istimewa Yogyakarta dan Muhammadiyah Covid-19 Command Center. *JHIP*. 2021 Sep 30;6(2):252-69.
22. Bonso H, Irwan I. Collaborative Governance Dalam Penanganan Covid-19. *Journal Governance and Politics (JGP)*. 2021 Nov 22;1(2):1-9.